

KRAKOW JUNE 2011 VOLUME 1 NUMBER 1

ARGUMENT

BIENNIAL PHILOSOPHICAL JOURNAL

Leading theme of the volume

Subjectivity and Self-knowledge

Department of Philosophy and Sociology



Pedagogical University of Cracow

Editor of the Volume
Marzenna Jakubczak

Verification of English
Guy Torr

Cover design
© Janusz Krupiński

Editing & proof
Ewa Bednarska-Gryniewicz
& Editors of the *Argument*:
Biannual Philosophical Journal

Typesetting and outline design
Tomasz Zacharski

On-line version design
Mariusz Szkółka
& Marzenna Jakubczak

www.argument-journal.eu

ISSN 2083-6635

Published by
© 2011 Uniwersytet Pedagogiczny
im. Komisji Edukacji Narodowej
w Krakowie
Instytut Filozofii i Socjologii
Pedagogical University of Cracow
Department of Philosophy and Sociology

Printed in Poland

Kraków 2011

Contents / Spis treści

Editor's notes: <i>Goal Statements For the Argument</i> by Marzenna Jakubczak (Editor-in-chief)	5
<i>Introduction to the Issue</i> by Marzenna Jakubczak (Volume Editor).	7

ARTICLES AND TREATICES / ARTYKUŁY I ROZPRAWY

Sven SELLMER <i>The Neophenomenological Theory of Subjectivity as a Tool for Comparative Studies</i>	9
Arindam CHAKRABARTI <i>Troubles with a Second Self: The Problem of Other Minds in 11th Century Indian and 20th Century Western Philosophy</i>	23
Marzenna JAKUBCZAK <i>The Collision of Language and Metaphysics in the Search for Self-Identity: on "Ahaṃkāra" and "Asmitā" in Sāṃkhya-Yoga</i>	37
Włodzimierz HEFLIK <i>Subject: Construct or Acting Being? The Status of the Subject and the Problem of Solipsism in Wittgenstein's Tractatus</i>	49
Roger MELIN <i>Animalism and Person as a Basic Sort</i>	69
Ryszard MIREK <i>The Systems of Relevance Logic</i>	87

TRANSLATION INTO POLISH / PRZEKŁADY

Zbigniew JAKUBOWSKI <i>Eugen Rosenstock-Huessy i jego myśl</i>	103
Eugen ROSENSTOCK-HUESSY <i>Pożegnanie z Kartezjuszem</i> (z języka angielskiego przełożył Zbigniew Jakubowski)	115
Søren KIERKEGAARD <i>Księga o Adlerze</i> (z duńskiego przełożył Antoni Szwed)	132

REVIEWS / RECENZJE

Reinhard BRANDT, <i>Immanuel Kant — Was bleibt?</i> (Anna Szyrwińska)	142
Hans-Georg GADAMER, <i>Wiek filozofii. Rozmowy z Riccardem Dottorim</i> (Paweł Sznajder)	145
Artur PRZYBYŚLAWSKI, <i>Buddyjska filozofia pustki</i> (Krzysztof Jakubczak)	149
Geoffrey SAMUEL, <i>The Origins of Yoga and Tantra Indic Religions to the Thirteenth Century</i> (Agnieszka Rostalska)	161

OBITUARIES AND MEMORIES / POŻEGNANIA I WSPOMNIENIA

Trud istnienia — wspomnienie o profesorze Jerzym Perzanowskim (1943–2009)
(Leopold ZGODA) 167

ANNOUNCEMENTS AND INVITATIONS / ZAPOWIEDZI I ZAPROSZENIA

Druga Konferencja Jaspersowska 173
Druga edycja ogólnopolskiej konferencji: Rocznice. 174
Zaproszenie do współpracy 174

Autorzy tomu 175
Contributors. 176

Editor's note

GOAL STATEMENT FOR THE ARGUMENT

It is my pleasure to present you the first issue of the *Argument: Biannual Philosophical Journal*, published by the Department of Philosophy and Sociology, Pedagogical University of Cracow. This is a peer-reviewed journal founded to facilitate dialogue between Polish and international scholars and, on the other hand, to build bridges between professional philosophers and a wider educated public.

We are open to the publishing of scholarly studies in history of philosophy as well as papers reporting the on-going debates in contemporary philosophy, representing various currents in philosophical inquiry, including continental, analytic, non-Western traditions and comparative perspectives. We also publish polemical papers, responses and interviews, book reviews and notices from professional philosophers. Besides, we are open to critical and innovative suggestions concerning teaching methods and the purposes of up-to-date philosophical education.

As the name itself suggests, the *Argument* is intended to provoke rational argument, encourage clear and precise reasoning, and enhance the essential philosophical need for justification and well-founded argument that support the presented views and clarify the accepted positions. The *Argument* is also intended to serve as a forum for dedicated philosophical debate, polemics and dispute implied by the plurality of the methods and possible interpretations developed within contemporary philosophy. Being aware of the variety of socio-epistemic dimensions of scholarship we also encourage critical, inter-disciplinary and creative articles on topics of traditional and emerging interest. Therefore, we welcome papers on such varied specialisations as: metaphysics, ontology, epistemology, axiology, logic, philosophy of religion, philosophy of mind, political philosophy, philosophy of science, as well as philosophical education, gender and feminist

thought, bioethics, environmental philosophy, etc. Favouring methodological and thematic plurality we also want to present philosophy as a rich field of great cultural and social value.

Although the editorial responsibility was passed onto me and my colleagues only last year, the journal, in fact, has a rather longer history. Originally it was founded in 2002, the year in which our Department was also established, and named *Studia Philosophica* and was included in the series *Annales Universitatis Paedagogicae Cracoviensis*. Five issues of *Studia Philosophica*, edited by the Faculty Members, were published till 2008. All papers comprised in those volumes were accepted by independent reviewers as well as being critically reviewed by the editors of the particular volumes.

However, in 2010 the aims and scope of the journal were essentially redefined and its structure reshaped. A new Editorial Board and Advisory Board have been appointed. We decided to change the previous title to *Argument: Biannual Philosophical Journal* and separate it from the University annual series, thus making the journal autonomous and adapting it to higher academic standards. Starting with June 2011, we are going to publish the journal twice a year, in June and December.

As one of the objectives of the *Argumentis* to facilitate the dissemination of philosophical knowledge to a wide group of reflective readers and critical thinkers we endorse an open access policy, one making therein the issues of our journal available both in print and freely accessible online in English and Polish at www.argument-journal.eu.

Marzenna Jakubczak
Editor-in-chief

Introduction to the Issue

The leading theme of the first volume of the *Argument: Biannual Philosophical Journal* is *Subjectivity and Self-knowledge*. Five contributors focused on this theme consider various aspects of the self, referring either to western authors (Włodzimierz Heflik, Roger Melin) or eastern thinkers (Marzenna Jakubczak), or undertaking a comparative perspective and discussing arguments given both by western and Indian philosophers (Arindam Chakrabarti, Sven Sellmer).

Sven Sellmer outlines the conception of subjectivity developed by the contemporary German neophenomenological philosopher Hermann Schmitz, which he finds suitable for cross-cultural investigations. He considers some of the applications and limits of Schmitzean terminology with reference to the problem of the self discussed both in Greek and Indian philosophical schools, like Stoicism on the Greek side, and early Buddhism, the early Upanishads and Sāṃkhya on the Indian side. Sellmer argues that neophenomenological terminological framework can not only aptly describe the individual systems of thought but, more importantly, it can serve as a basis for a comparison of the described philosophies.

In Arindam Chakrabarti's paper the issue of "other mind", or an ego's access to the contents of the mind of a "second ego", is concerned. The author briefly discusses the most popular contemporary arguments explaining how our knowledge of the second person is possible, then he concentrates on reconstructing the argument offered by the 11th century Indian philosopher, Abhinavagupta. Chakrabarti suggests that Abhinavagupta anticipated some contemporary scientific theories and gestured towards a transcendental argument out of the very possibility of genuine empathy and interpersonal communication.

The following paper by Marzenna Jakubczak focuses on the collision of language and metaphysics as it is understood in two classical systems

of Indian philosophy, Sāṃkhya and Yoga. The clash occurs when the grammatical rules and common linguistic procedures used to express the sense of subjectivity prove to be inadequate and misleading for the seeker of true self-identity. The author presents the gnosological purposes and cognitive instruments suggested by both systems. She also offers some possible readings of ‘ahaṃkāra’ and ‘asmitā’ displayed in the context of Sāṃkhya-Yoga phenomenology and metaphysics.

In his paper, Włodzimirz Heflik discusses the status of the subject and the problem of solipsism in *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus*. He clearly exhibits two ways of grasping the subject suggested by Wittgenstein — as a boundary (of the world), and the world, as well as different methods of conceiving the self, both logical and transcendental. Apart from considering some naturalistic or reductionist consequences of solipsism, Heflik examines the concept of the “subject of will”, referring it to the metaphysical subject as a boundary of the world. In conclusion he offers an interpretation inspired by Schopenhauer’s conception of the double aspect of the subject, that is to overcome the difficulties of Wittgenstein’s conception of the self.

The last contribution on the theme *Subjectivity and Self-knowledge* is a paper on Animalism by Roger Melin. The author argues for philosophical Animalism (originally articulated by Olson, Snowdon, Ayers), clarifying its key precepts and general position. He applies the animalist terminology to define the criteria of self-identity and the limits of self-knowledge. While accepting most of the animalist claims, Melin argues against the belief that a *person* should be understood as a phase sortal concept. He suggests that being a person is an irreducible part of our basic conceptual structure and it should be taken as a basic substance sortal concept through which we have to individuate ourselves and others.

Another article published in this volume, not related to the leading theme, discusses some aspects and implications of relevance logic (Ryszard Mirek). The rest of the contributions are published in Polish, including two translations: one of Eugen Rosenstock-Huussy from English (by Zbigniew Jakubowski who preceded his translation with an introductory article) and one of Søren Kierkegaard from Danish (by Antoni Szwed), and four book reviews (by Krzysztof Jakubczak, Agnieszka Rostalska, Paweł Sznajder, Anna Szyrwińska) as well as an article commemorating the late professor Jerzy Perzanowski (by Leopold Zgoda).

Marzenna Jakubczak
Volume Editor